

Civic Education and Citizenship in Escuela Nueva Schools In Colombia



ABSTRACT

This study was initiated to stimulate thought, foster a greater understanding of what constitutes effective civic education and emphasize the potential of civic education in developing countries and countries in conflict. Escuela Nueva is proposed as a model of effective civic education. The Escuela Nueva School will be studied with the goal of determining:

1. How the civic learning inside the school affects student activity outside the school.
2. How Escuela Nueva schools compare to regular rural schools regarding the promotion of civic learning.
3. How development of civic knowledge, skills and disposition influences the civic participation of the graduates of the Escuela Nueva program.

All of these questions will be studied by comparing Escuela Nueva schools with regular rural schools in Colombia. In light of the analysis outlined, conclusions will be made about the suitability of Escuela Nueva as an effective vehicle for the promotion of civic education and civic participation.

PURPOSE

To identify and document how students in Escuela Nueva schools compare with students in regular rural schools in the understanding and demonstration of civic learning and citizenship inside and outside the classroom and after graduation from the program.

RATIONALE

In Colombia, many young children live in areas of high conflict, where they learn that violence and the use of force are the only ways to survive. If these young children have low self-esteem and few prospects for their future, their value of human life and their behaviour can be deeply influenced. This can lead to a violent lifestyle, as is seen in the ever-increasing number of youth joining terrorist groups and in the youth crime rate. The tendency towards violence is visible not only in the poorer communities but also in the criminal activity of the more affluent groups. The drug cartels are an ever-present icon of Colombian society and the disparity in the social classes provokes conflict on many different levels. The United Nations has declared the activities of the right-wing paramilitary groups against the guerrilla terrorist factions a human rights violation. In a country where laws, for the most part, only apply to the less financially able, Colombia must look for effective ways to educate its children so that they have a true understanding of what it means to live harmoniously in society. The Colombian government has recognized the dilemma and the Ministry of Education has now made a law requiring curriculum for "educación para la convivencia" (education for coexistence). Unfortunately, evidence of this civic education is sparse in and outside the classroom.

There is ample evidence, that in all countries, society has fallen short in terms of the understanding and acceptance of the rights and responsibilities of its members. Citizens must understand and act according to their rights and responsibilities for the maintenance and improvement of any constitutional democracy. History teaches us that few countries have maintained a democratic government for a sustained period of time. The dispositions that inform the democratic ethos are not inherited. As Alex de Tocqueville pointed out, each new generation is a new people that must acquire the knowledge, learn the skills, and develop the dispositions or traits of private and public character that undergird a constitutional democracy. (Tocqueville, 1969)

Civic education should be a primary concern of every educational system. Citizens must have the requisite knowledge, skills and dispositions to implement the fundamental values and principles of democracy. These values should include a society in which human rights are respected, the individual's dignity and worth are acknowledged, the rule of law is observed, people are willing to fulfill their responsibilities and the common good is the concern of all.

I propose to examine a system of schooling that was originally an educational innovation with the objective of providing the full five year, basic primary cycle to rural areas. This system, called Escuela Nueva, has been evaluated in terms of academic achievement but not for its potential effectiveness in the area of civic education.

The questions, I would like to explore are:

How is the methodology practiced inside the school applied outside the school?

How do Escuela Nueva schools compare to regular rural schools regarding the promotion of civic learning?

What is the effect of civic education in Escuela Nueva schools on the later civic behaviour of former students?

INTRODUCTION

State of Education in Rural Colombia

Education in Latin America suffers from serious problems. The problem is not one of access to schooling which is now almost universal even in the isolated and sparsely populated rural areas. The problem is one of poor quality education. Both the urban and the rural areas suffer from poor quality schools but the effects are more manifest in the rural areas. Indications that the quality in the rural schools of Colombia is not meeting student needs are evident in the high repetition rates, the high drop out rates and low scores on achievement tests. Twenty percent of rural children do not attend school at all even though they have access. Dropout rates are 18.9% after grade one, 14.5 % after grade two and 13.6% after grade three. Repetition rates in the rural schools are shockingly high. After grade one, 40.8% of students are required to repeat the year. (McEwan: 1998)

What is Escuela Nueva?

Escuela Nueva, or the New School, is a rural school program that was initiated in 1975 in an effort to address the problems in Colombian education programs. It was born out of the Unitary School approach promoted by UNESCO (United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization) in 1961. The Unitary School was implemented in Colombia, and it was designed to: allow schools to run effectively with only one teacher, facilitate active learning and enable automatic promotion. The Unitary School was the program of choice until 1975, at which time it became apparent that there were difficulties with the universalization of methodology, the consistency in programming and the excessive teacher preparation of materials. Escuela Nueva was founded to combat these and other problems facing rural education.

Escuela Nueva integrates curricular, community, administrative-financial and training strategies. (Colbert, 1992) It provides active instruction, a stronger relationship between the school and the community and flexible promotion geared towards the success of the rural child. It started on two fundamental assumptions. The first was that "improving educational effectiveness would require creative changes in the training of teachers, in the administrative structure and in the relations with the community". (Colbert, 1992) The second is that the program had to be designed such that it could easily be replicated and implemented on a wide-scale.

Escuela Nueva encourages child centered active learning, a relevant curriculum based on the student's daily life, a flexible system of promotion, a closer relationship between the school and the community, an emphasis on the formation of democratic and participatory values and effective, practical in-service teacher training strategies. (Colbert: 1998)

What is civic education?

Civic education is instruction in self-government which promotes the understanding of the ideals of democracy and instills a reasoned commitment to the values and principles of democracy. Civic education must be realistic and not utopian, addressing the central truths about political life. The essential components of a good civic education are set forth by the National Standard for Civics and Government for the United States (Center for Civic Education: 1994) and can be adapted to the Colombian situation. The three essential components of civic education are civic

knowledge, civic skills and civic dispositions. These components are explained in detail in the literature review.

What is citizenship?

Aristotle said in his *Politics*, "If liberty and equality, as is thought by some, are chiefly to be found in democracy, they will be attained when all persons alike share in the government to the utmost". In other words, the ideals of democracy can only be realized when citizens take part in the governance of their community. Citizenship is participation in a democratic society which must be based on informed, critical reflection and on the understanding and acceptance of the rights and responsibilities that go with that membership. (Branson: 1998) Democratic government means that citizens are actively involved in their own governance, they do not passively accept decisions made on their behalf or obey orders without question.

How is civic education incorporated into the Escuela Nueva program?

Escuela Nueva emphasizes co-operative learning rather than frontal, teacher centered learning. Co-operative learning allows students to develop their ability to interact diplomatically, accept differences in opinion, develop group problem-solving strategies, express themselves, present new ideas, listen to others, give and accept constructive criticism and work co-operatively towards a goal. Students are more likely to learn that the power of reason can be more effective than physical force and that their contribution is important. Escuela Nueva uses classroom texts that are based on active learning and focus on activities in which the students must problem-solve, work together and help each other. Escuela Nueva encourages peer tutoring. The classes are usually comprised of one teacher and students from grades 1-5 in one room. Since the teacher is not available to help with every activity, the students must learn to depend on each other and themselves for explanations and solutions.

Escuela Nueva features classrooms where:

- learning is emphasized above teaching
- the student is responsible for his or her own learning
- learning is an interactive process
- the texts are geared towards interactive and experiential learning
- co-operative learning is one of the principal pedagogical methods used
- the focus is on improving communication and problem-solving skills
- parents are encouraged to participate in school activities
- students are encouraged to participate in the school direction through the organization of a student government
- students self-monitor their responsibilities such as attendance and homework while a teacher oversees the monitoring activities

John Dewey suggested a similar type of system in which the students were best able to develop civic values:

The great thing to keep in mind, then, regarding the introductions into the school of various forms of active occupation, is that through them the entire spirit of the school is renewed. It has a chance to affiliate itself with life, to become the child's habitat, where he learns through directed living, instead of being only a place to learn lessons having an abstract and remote reference to some possible living to be done in the future. It gets a chance to be a miniature community, an embryonic society. This is the fundamental fact, and from this arise continuous and orderly streams of instruction. Under the industrial régime described, the child, after all, shared in the work, not for the sake of the sharing, but for the sake of the product. The educational results secured were real, yet incidental and dependent. But in the school the typical occupations followed are freed from all economic stress. The aim is not the economic value of the products, but the development of social power and insight. It is the liberation from narrow utilities, this openness to the possibilities of the human spirit, that makes these practical activities in the school allies of art and centers of science and history. (Dewey:1990)

LITERATURE REVIEW



Headlines in North America search for the answers to questions like: "What went wrong?" (TIME: 1999) when talking about the violent tragedies taking place in schools today. There has been a notable rise in violence in schools over the last decade. There are many theories about the societal reasons for this rise as well as many proposed reforms in the educational system created to combat it. Do any of these reforms really work?

Neil Postman, a modern-day social critic, suggests that education no longer has a narrative and that humanity needs narratives to give meaning to its labors, history, present and future. He condemns in accordance with Dewey, the narrative of economic utility that our government often condones as the viable reason for education. Postman declares that it is more important for schooling to address how to make a life, than how to make a living. (Postman: 1995)

John Dewey criticizes traditional education saying: "The mere absorbing of facts and truths is so exclusively individual an affair that it tends very naturally to pass into selfishness. There is no obvious social motive for the acquirement of mere learning, there is no clear social gain in success thereat." (Dewey: 1990) The shortfalls of the schools in Dewey's time can be applied to today's schools as well." In the schoolroom the motive and the cement of social organization are alike wanting. Upon the ethical side, the tragic weakness of the present school is that it endeavors to prepare future members of the social order in a medium in which the conditions of the social spirit are eminently wanting".(Dewey: 1990) John Dewey proposes a theory that participatory dispositions needed by citizens in a democracy are learned through practice in school and community.

Free institutions are among humanity's highest achievements. They are defended by democracy and, in order to preserve democracy, civic education must come to the forefront. The curriculum for civic education should include training for civic knowledge, civic skills and civic dispositions. Civic knowledge is concerned with what citizens ought to know. In the United States, the National Standards and the Civics Framework for the 1998 National Assessment of Educational Progress (NAEP) embodies the knowledge component in five significant questions (Center for Civic Education: 1994):

- What are civic life, politics and government?
- What are the foundations of the American political system?
- How does the government established by the Constitution embody the purposes, values and principles of American democracy?
- What is the relationship of the United States to other nations and to world affairs?
- What are the roles of citizens in American democracy?

These questions can be adapted to civic education in other countries such as Colombia. They can be used for primary level education, although a simplification of vocabulary may be necessary. Democracy is a dialogue and the use of questions reflects that democracy is a search for new and better ways to realize ideals.

Civic skills represent the intellectual and participatory abilities necessary for students to exercise their rights and responsibilities as members of self-governing communities. These skills are inseparable from knowledge in that, to be able to critically think about a political issue, one must have an understanding of the issue, its history and its contemporary relevance.(Branson: 1998) Students need to be proficient at applying critical thinking skills that include identifying and describing, explaining and analyzing, evaluating and defending positions, and making decisions and choices on public issues. Students should also be able to distinguish emotional language and symbols and the true purposes for which they are used. The development of these skills should start from a very early age. (Branson: 1994; Salm: 1991; Schiefelbein: 1994) Younger children can learn to interact in small groups or committees, to pool information, exchange opinions or formulate plans of action appropriate to their level of maturity. (Branson: 1994)

Civic disposition refers to the traits of public or private character essential to the maintenance and improvement of democracy. These dispositions develop slowly, over time and as a result of experience in the school, community and family. Traits of private character include moral responsibility, self-discipline, respect, and worth for the human dignity of every individual. Traits of public character include: public spiritedness, civility, respect for the rule of law, critical mindedness, and willingness to listen, negotiate and compromise. (Branson: 1994) These traits are essential to the preservation of democracy. Judge Learned Hand captured the importance of civic disposition when he said:

Liberty lies in the hearts of men and women; when it dies there, no constitution, no law, no court can save it; no constitution, no law can even do much to help it. While it lies there, it needs no constitution, no law, no court to save it. (Hand: 1944)

The participatory classroom, which incorporates co-operative methods, fosters civic learning. (Johnson y Johnson: 1983, Schiefelbein: 1994) Research has shown that in these classrooms, students have a more positive sense of self and are more able to demonstrate civic disposition and skills.

Evidence shows that formal education is one of the strongest factors in explaining what citizens do in politics. (Nie, 1996) Wolfinger and Rosenstone argue that education does three things. First, it increases cognitive skills, which facilitates learning about politics. People then have the skills necessary for processing political information and for making political decisions. Second, better-educated people are likely to get more gratification from political participation. Finally, schools expose students to a variety of bureaucratic relationships which helps them overcome the procedural difficulties of registering and voting. (Nie, 1996)

Carole Hahn studied participatory disposition of students in five different first world countries to compare the civic education in the five countries. Her findings show that participatory dispositions needed by citizens in a democracy are learned through practice in school and community. (Hahn, 1998)

RESEARCH DESIGN

The development of civic values is a life-long process and in a truly democratic society all citizens should be politically active. The results of a good civic education should be evident in students presently attending school and long after a student has left the schooling system. The analysis and measurement of the extent and effect of a good civic education is a complex process and necessitates both qualitative and quantitative data. Three questions will be addressed and to minimize the confounding effects of using only one method, triangulation will be employed. Triangulation is the use of multiple and different informants, methods, investigators and theories. (Robson, 1993)

The lack of attention from the government and absence of local management systems have resulted in the decline of Escuela Nueva schools during the past decade. The schools that have survived are in the areas where local political support is strong. This is particularly true in the coffee region, including the provinces of Caldas, Manizales and Armenia. In these areas, students helped train new teachers, Escuela Nueva teachers who remained in the area conscientiously maintained and monitored the program and the Coffee Growers Association continually assisted the program. The records for many of the Escuela Nueva schools in other regions have been lost or misplaced such that it not know whether these schools presently implement the Escuela Nueva methods. For the purposes of this study it is also important to identify communities where the Escuela Nueva program has been in operation long enough to have produced graduates that are now of voting age. Research by the Fundación Volvamos a la Gente (Back to the People Foundation) shows that there are about 150 communities in which schools are still known to practice the Escuela Nueva method faithfully. These are schools which have been in existence for more than 15 years (reports will be included in thesis). Due to this limited number of schools, random sampling of students in different regions will not be possible and thus generalizations to the wider population in other regions would not be statistically valid. Nevertheless, by exploring the relationships between variables for the chosen sample and by comparing findings with other research, it is hoped that insight might be gained into the influence that Escuela Nueva has on the civic development of students in Colombia.

METHODS

I. Sampling

A) Site Selection

The sites to be selected for this study will consist of 3 communities in which Escuela Nueva schools exist and 3 geographically matched communities where Escuela Nueva schools do not exist. A non-probability sample will be taken from the existing database as has been prepared over a five year period of evaluation by the Fundación Volvamos a la Gente. This sample consists of approximately 150 rural schools which have been evaluated for

consistency with the Escuela Nueva Methods (McEwan, 1998). Since there is only one school per community, the communities where these schools exist will be identified and a sample of 3 communities for use in this study will be selected by lottery. The schools will be matched geographically to control for factors such as access to qualified teachers in the region, access to materials, student absence due to frequent crop harvests and other regional impediments that might serve to explain the differences in the systems. Further specifics of sampling methods used for studying each of the questions posed in the study can be found in the section that follows.

B) Informant Selection

The informants consist of four groups: Escuela Nueva students, non-Escuela Nueva students, Escuela Nueva graduates and non-Escuela Nueva graduates. All of the students, in the selected Escuela Nueva schools and matched schools will be used in the study (there are an average of 30 students in each Escuela Nueva schools). The specific information about the number of students in regular rural schools is unavailable but the pilot study will indicate how many students attend school in these communities. If the sample is too large, a random sample of 30 students in each classroom will be selected for the interviews and questionnaire and all students will be included in the classroom observations. Twenty graduates of voting age will be selected for this study from each of the 3 Escuela Nueva communities and the non-Escuela Nueva communities. The twenty graduates will be chosen from records available in each school. In the case where there are no records snowball sampling will be used (Robson, 1993). In snowball sampling, one graduate of the school program will help in identifying other graduates in the community. The pilot study will help identify the most appropriate method of sampling.

II. Investigators

One primary investigator and two members from the Fundación Volvamos a la Gente will conduct all interviews and observations. All three investigators will collaborate in standardizing questionnaires, interview and observational techniques in order to minimize the effects of interpretation by the investigator and encourage consistency. For the same reasons, all analyses of data will also be done in collaboration. This triangulation serves to minimize confounding effects.

III. Pilot Study

Pilot studies of all of the tools used for data collection will be conducted using a pilot sample. This is a necessary step as the tools used for the study need to be field tested because the information regarding the communities is scarce and unforeseen situations affecting data collection and data tools may arise. A situational analysis of the site will be made and, based on findings during the pilot study the tools for data collection will be revised accordingly.

IV. Data Collection

Building on the work of previous researcher and theories, questionnaires, open interview questions and structured observations will be constructed. These will measure political attitudes, political behaviour, political participation, political beliefs, classroom climate regarding freedom of expression and indicators of democratic behaviour in the classroom. Questionnaires and interview questions will be translated into Spanish and the level of language will be adjusted according to what is deemed most appropriate for the context and the participants. The questionnaires in the appendices serve as examples of the general content that will be used in the actual questionnaires. The questionnaires to be used in the study will be modified to include simpler language for the primary school students and some more culturally relevant questions. Examples relating to the participants real life will be presented to facilitate the understanding of the intent of the questions. Many of the tools used in this study are based on tools developed in previous studies. The original authors of these tools will be asked for permission before this study will proceed.

A) Fully structured interviews:

- i) The sample of 30 students in both the Escuela Nueva and the non-Escuela Nueva communities will be interviewed using the questionnaire on classroom climate (Appendix A) and democratic behaviour.

- ii) The sample of 20 graduates in each of the Escuela-Nueva and the non-Escuela Nueva communities will be interviewed using the questionnaires on political attitudes, efficacy, trust, confidence and behaviour (Appendix D).

B) Structured observations:

The Escuela-Nueva and the non-Escuela Nueva classrooms will be observed over a period of two weeks and data will be collected using the chart developed for the identifying the indicators of democratic behaviour (Appendix C). The investigator will record the behaviours in the chart and will write field notes describing anomalies and other pertinent information. Codes for each of the behaviours will be developed for the analysis.

C) Semi-structured interviews:

- iii) The sample of 30 students in both the Escuela-Nueva and the non-Escuela Nueva communities will be interviewed using the semi-structured questionnaires on democratic behaviours and attitudes (Appendix B). The interviews will be audio-recorded and transcribed verbatim.
- iv) The sample of 20 graduates in each of the Escuela-Nueva and the non-Escuela Nueva communities will be interviewed using the semi-structured questionnaires on political attitudes and behaviours (Appendix E). The interviews will be audio-recorded and transcribed verbatim.

B) A field diary:

Each investigator will keep a diary in order to record impressions from interviews and observation sessions.

V. Data Analysis:

Responses to questionnaire items and results from structured observations will be factor analyzed and item analyses will be performed. Means by items and scales will be compared for each match pair of schools and then a similar analysis will be done by gender and by region. Frequency distributions by items and correlations between scales will be examined. Field notes from structured observations and semi-structured interviews will be examined for themes. Analyses will be reviewed with the interviewees as a form of member-check and to minimize interpretation on the part of the investigators. Each component of the qualitative data set (field notes, interviews and field diary) will be analyzed to generate themes from the raw data. Meaningful data will be assigned a code to facilitate comparisons and to look for causes, conditions, processes and consequences as suggested by Hahn. (Hahn, 1998)

ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

This study will deal with human subjects who will be observed and questioned. The University of Toronto Policy states that for all investigations involving human subjects a consent form must be signed and a protocol review must be done. Consent will have to be obtained from the schools and the individuals participating in the study. A copy of the consent form is available in Appendix F in English and in Appendix G in Spanish. A copy of the letter of consent from the administration is available in Appendix H. This letter will be translated into Spanish. A copy of the protocol required by the University of Toronto is available in Appendix I.

REFERENCES

- Arboleda, J., Chiappe C. & Colbert, V. (1990). *The New School Program: More and Better Primary Education for Children in Rural Areas in Colombia*. Bogota: UNICEF.
- Banco Mundial. (1996). *Hacia una Nueva Escuela para el Siglo XXI: Guía*. Bogota: el Instituto de Desarrollo Económico.
- Branson, M. (1998). *The Role of Civic Education*. California: Policy Task Force Paper for the Centre for Civic Education.
- Castillo, G., Colbert, V. & Schiefelbein, E. (1994). *Guías de aprendizaje para una escuela deseable*. Santiago: UNESCO/UNICEF.
- Castillo, Z. & Rojas, C. (1989). *Evaluation of the New School Programme*. Bogota: SER Research Institute.
- Chesterfield, R. (1994). *Indicators of Democratic Behavior in Nueva Escuela Unitaria (NEU) Schools*. Guatemala: Juarez and Associates, Inc.
- Centre for Civic Education. (1994). *National Standards for Civics and Government*. Calabasas, CA: Center for Civic Education.
- Colbert, V. (1995). *Improving the Access and Quality of Education for the Rural Poor*. Bogota: Fundación Volvamos a la Gente.
- Cruz, C. & Sandoval, F. (1996). *La educación rural: De la utopía a la realidad*. Ibagué, Colombia: El Poirá Editores e Impresores.
- Dewey, J. (1990). *The School and Society. The Child and the Curriculum*. Chicago: The University of the Chicago Press.
- Fagerlind, I. & Saha, L. (1990). *Education and National Development: A Comparative Perspective*. Oxford: Pergamon Press.
- Fundación Volvamos a la Gente. (1998). *Una Escuela para la Convivencia*. Bogota: Fundación Volvamos a la Gente.
- Fundación Volvamos a la Gente. (1999). *Requerimientos e indicadores relacionados con factores de calidad, proceso de aula e insumos de apoyo a la escuela*. Bogota: Fundación Volvamos a la Gente.
- Hahn, C. (1998). *Becoming Political: Comparative perspectives on citizenship education*. New York: State University of New York.
- Harris, R. (1998). *Aprendizaje Cooperativo*. Bogota: Fundación Volvamos a la Gente.
- Harris, R. (1993). *Managing Social and Sensitive Issues in the Learning Environment*. Bogota: UNICEF.
- Juarez et al. (1992). *Multigrade Schools: An Information Packet* USAID LAC Bureau. Los Angeles: Juarez and Associates, Inc.
- Laboratorio Latinoamericano de Evaluación de la Calidad de la Educación. (1998). *Primer Estudio Internacional Comparativo*. Chile: Androx Ltda. UNESCO.
- López, A. (1999). *Colombia Exports its "New School" Blueprint*. The Unesco Courier: June.
- Misión Social. (1997). *La calidad de la educación. Planeación & Desarrollo, XVIII*. Bogota: Ministerio de

Educacion.

- McEwan, P. (1998). *The Effectiveness of Multigrade Schools in Colombia*. Stanford: Elsevier Science Ltd.
- McGinn, N. (1996). *Crossing Lines*. Westport, CT: Praeger Publishers.
- Nie, N., Junn, J. (1996). *Education and Democratic Citizenship in America*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Ochoa, R. (1995). *Educación Ciudadana y Gobierno Escolar*. Bogota: Corporación Viva la Ciudadanía.
- Postman, N. (1995). *The End of Education*. New York: Vintage Books.
- Psacharopoulos, G., Rojas, C. & Velez, E. (1993). *Achievement Evaluation Of Colombia's Escuela Nueva: Is Multigrade the Answer?*. *Comparative Education Review*, 37 (3) pp.263-276.
- Robson, C. (1993). *Real World Research*. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Salm, R. (1991). *Peace Education: A Framework and References*. New York: UNICEF.
- Schiefelbein, E. (1991). *In Search of the school of the XXI Century*. Santiago, Chile: UNESCO Regional Office.
- Schiefelbein, E. (1992). *Redefining Basic Education for Latin America: Lessons to be learned from the Colombian Escuela Nueva*. Paris: UNESCO, International Institute for Educational Planning.
- Schiefelbein, E. (1994). *Discurso de E. Schiefelbein, Ministro de Educacion en la reunion preparatoria de la 44th Conferencia Internacional de la Educacion OREALC*. Chile: Ministro de Educacion.
- Shaw, C. & Thomas, C. (1992). *Issues in the Development of Multigrade Schools*. Washington: World Bank.
- Scotford-Archer, M. (1977). *Social Origins of Educational Systems*. London: SAGE Publications Ltd.
- Tocqueville, A. (1969). *Democracy in America*. New York: Anchor Books
- UNICEF. (1998). *Working Paper on Peace Education in UNICEF*. New York: UNICEF.
- Vygotsky, L. (1978). *Mind in Society*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.
- World Bank Policy Paper. (1990). *Primary Education*. Washington: The World Bank
- World Conference on the Education for All. (1990). *Meeting Basics Learning Needs: A Vision for the 1990s*. New York: UNICEF House.

APPENDIX A: **FULLY STRUCTURE INTERVIEW FOR PRIMARY SCHOOL STUDENTS**

Introduction

Welcome, you have been asked to complete this questionnaire to help us determine what the atmosphere in your classroom is like.

Have your parents signed a consent form? Yes _____ No _____
(If the answer is no, the interview should be terminated as consent **MUST** be obtained)

Code identifying participant _____

Please answer the questions by indicating whether you

1 - strongly disagree with the statement, 2 - disagree, 3 - are neutral, 4 - agree, 5 - strongly agree

(N.B. in the actual questionnaire the language will be simplified and specific examples of political, economic and social situations in the classroom and community will be provided so that the responses can be properly contextualized)

SD	D	N	A	SA	
					Our teachers respect our opinions and encourage us to express them.
					In this class pupils are encouraged to make up their own minds about issues.
					In our classes teachers try to get students to speak freely and openly.
					Pupils can express themselves freely even when they are disagreeing with the teacher.
					When my opinion is different from most of the other students and from the teacher, I feel comfortable and am likely to speak.
					I enjoy listening to the opinions of others.
					In our classes we often discuss controversial, political, economic and social issues.
					In our classes we usually learn about more than one side of a political issue.
					Our teachers are interested in students' ideas about politics and government and like to hear what we have to say.
					In our classrooms we are encouraged to consider many points of view on issues.
					Students are interested in hearing other students opinions about politics.
					It is important for everyone to be able to express an opinion.
					The content of some opinions is more important than that of others.
					If someone is expressing an opinion that is contrary to the beliefs of most of the people in the class, I think they should be stopped.
					Some people's opinions are more important than others.

(Scale developed by Carole Hahn (1998) and adapted by Jenny Pitt)



**APPENDIX B:
SEMI-STRUCTURED INTERVIEW**

Introduction:

Welcome, you will be asked some questions about your political activities and attitudes in your school and your community, as well as some question regarding what you think about democracy in Colombia and some of the actions of your government.

Have your parents signed a consent form? Yes _____ No _____
(If the answer is no, the interview should be terminated as consent MUST be obtained)

Code identifying participant _____

Political activities and attitudes in school (adapted from the Center for Civic Education, 1994 ; Ochoa, 1995)

- 1) Are you a member of your student government?
- 2) How do you think a member of the student government should act?
- 3) How do you (or would you act)?
- 4) What are the advantages of being on the student government?
- 5) What are the disadvantages of being on the student government?
- 6) How should the student government affect the school community?
- 7) How should the student government affect the larger community?
- 8) Do you think the student government is a good or a bad thing to have? Why?
- 9) How is the student government responsible to the school community?
- 10) How is the student government responsible to the larger community?
- 11) Do you think the student government lives up to its responsibilities? Explain your answer.

Citizenship in the community (adapted from the Center for Civic Education, 1994; Ochoa, 1995)

- 1) What rights do people have ?
- 2) How can you help your community?
- 3) What actions on your part would hurt your community?
- 4) What is a leader?
- 5) What responsibilities do leaders in a community have?
- 6) What should people do if they disagree?
- 7) How do communities decide on the best solutions to their problems?
- 8) How can citizens help solve the problem of violence in Colombia?

Government (adapted from the Center for Civic Education, 1994; Ochoa, 1995)

- 1) What is a democratic government?
- 2) Why is a government important?
- 3) How should a government be selected?
- 4) What are the responsibilities of a government?
- 5) Do governments often live up to their responsibilities? Explain your answer.
- 6) How can the government help solve the problems of violence in Colombia?



APPENDIX C:
INDICATORS OF DEMOCRATIC BEHAVIOUR IN CHILDREN

Behaviour	Indicators
1. Egalitarian beliefs	a. Takes Turns
	b. Assists other students in an activity
2. Interpersonal effectiveness	a. Expresses opinions or attitudes to peers and adults
	b. Choose among viable options
3. Leadership/involvement	a. Participates in school organizations
	b. Directs fellow students in an activity

(chart from Chesterfield, 1994 ---will be adapted and expanded for this study)

APPENDIX D: **FULLY-STRUCTURED INTERVIEWS FOR GRADUATES**

Introduction

Welcome, you have been asked complete these questionnaires so that we can better understand your political attitudes and activities.

Have you signed a consent form? Yes _____ No _____
(If the answer is no, the interview should be terminated as consent **MUST** be obtained)

Code identifying participant _____

Political Activity

Please select the number which indicates how likely you are to participate in the following activities: 1 - Definitely not likely, 2 - Not very likely, 3 - Somewhat likely, 4 - Likely, 5 - Very Likely

NL	NVL	SL	L	VL	
					How likely are you to vote in the next national election?
					How likely are you to vote in the next local election?
					How likely is it that you will let your Representative in Parliament know what you think about a public issue?
					How likely is it that you will let your local government know how you feel about a public issue?
					How likely are you to run for political office?
					How likely are you to join a political organization?
					How likely are you to join a pressure or a protest group?
					How likely are you to protest non-violently during a strike?
					How likely is it that you will work for a political candidate?
					How likely are you to protest using violence during a strike?
					Are your family members likely to vote during an election?

(Scale developed by Carole Hahn (1998) — adapted by Jenny Pitt)

Political Experience

Please select the number which indicates how frequently you are involved in the following activities: 1 - Never, 2 - Hardly ever, 3 - Sometimes, 4 - 2 to 3 times per week, 5 - Often (daily)

N	HE	S	FO	O	
					How frequently do you use <i>television</i> to learn about public affairs, current events and political issues?
					How frequently do you use <i>newspapers</i> to learn about public affairs, current events, and political issues?
					How frequently do you use <i>radio</i> to learn about public affairs, current events, and political issues?
					How frequently do you discuss currents events and politics in your family?
					How often do you discuss politics with your friends?

(Scale developed by Carole Hahn (1998) — adapted by Jenny Pitt)

Political Experience

Please select the number which indicates how frequently you are involved in the following activities: 1 - Never, 2 - Once or Twice, 3 - More than Twice

N	OT	MT	
			Have you ever been a representative for the student council?
			Have you ever worn any form of advertisement (sticker, button, badge) affiliating yourself with a candidate for political office?
			Have you ever helped a candidate for political office by doing things for him/her such as handing out badge, pamphlets or buttons?
			Have you ever belonged to a political club (a group that discusses political issues)?
			Have you ever collected for a charity?

(Scale developed by Carole Hahn (1998) --- adapted by Jenny Pitt)

Political Interest

Please select the number which indicates your level of agreement with each statement:

1 - Strongly Disagree, 2 - Disagree, 3 - Neutral, 4 - Agree, 5 - Strongly Agree

SD	D	N	A	SA	
					I am usually interested in political matters.
					I enjoy attending meetings where politics and government are discussed.
					I understand how political parties in Colombia work.
					I would be interested in finding out more about how political parties in Colombia work.
					I would be interested in finding out more about how political parties in other countries work.
					I think hearing or watching news about politics and politicians is interesting.
					I enjoy political campaigns.
					I participate in political activities.
					I would enjoy being involved in making political decisions that affect my school or community.
					I think I would enjoy participating in political groups.
					I think it would be interesting to run for local political office.
					I think it would be interesting to run for the federal government.
					I would like to be a member of a political party.
					I would enjoy being on a committee (group) nominating candidates for political office.
					I would like to be a member of a political party but I think it is dangerous to express my political views.

(Scale developed by Carole Hahn (1998) --- adapted by Jenny Pitt)

Political Efficacy

Please select the number which indicates your level of agreement with each statement:

1 - Strongly Disagree, 2 - Disagree, 3 - Uncertain, 4 - Agree, 5 - Strongly Agree

SD	D	U	A	SA	
					The way people vote is important to deciding how things are run in this country.
					People like me and my parents can influence political decisions at a regional level.
					People like me and my parents can influence political decisions at a national level.
					My family has a say about what the local government does.
					My family has a say about what the national government does.
					It is dangerous for me to express my political opinions.

(Scale developed by Carole Hahn (1998) --- adapted by Jenny Pitt)

Political Confidence

Please select the number which indicates your level of agreement with each statement:

1 - Strongly Disagree, 2 - Disagree, 3 - Uncertain, 4 - Agree, 5 - Strongly Agree

SD	D	U	A	SA	
					I am able to influence group decisions.
					Although it is not the most popular thing to do, I can often get my way in groups.
					I am the kind of person who is able to influence others in decision-making situations.
					I am the kind of person who can influence how other people decide to vote in elections.
					I can convince others to support candidates I am supporting for elections.
					If I joined a political party or organization, I would be the kind of member who is able to change people's minds on important issues.
					I can have much influence on how other people live.
					I can usually persuade others to agree with my opinions about political matters.
					I can be effective in political situations (influencing decisions made in school and community)

(Scale developed by Carole Hahn (1998) --- adapted by Jenny Pitt)

**APPENDIX E:
SEMI-STRUCTURED INTERVIEW FOR GRADUATES**

Introduction

Welcome, you have been asked to participate in this interview so that we can better understand your political attitudes and activities.

Have you signed a consent form? Yes _____ No _____
(If the answer is no, the interview should be terminated as consent MUST be obtained)

Code identifying participant _____

Human Rights and Political Order (adapted from the Center for Civic Education, 1994; Ochoa, 1995)

(N.B. The language used in this questions will be simplified as the level of education of the participants may be low)

- 1) What rights and liberties do person have by virtue of their being human?
- 2) What are human rights and liberty?
- 3) Why do countries create form of government?
- 4) How does one nation influence other nations?
- 5) How do relationships with other nations influence Colombia's society and politics?
- 6) What things threaten democracy?
- 7) Is there a relationship between democracy within Colombia and peace within Colombia? Explain.

Political Community and Government (adapted from the Center for Civic Education, 1994; Ochoa, 1995)

- 1) How do people become unified as "the people" of a political community (common purposes)
- 2) Why are the people the ultimate authority in a democracy?
- 3) What is a government?
- 4) Is a government necessary? Explain.
- 5) How is a democratic government consistent with the principles of human liberty?
- 6) What tensions might exist between individual liberty and rule by the people?
- 7) Is Colombia a democratic society? Explain your answer.

Democracy (adapted from the Center for Civic Education, 1994; Ochoa, 1995)

- 1) What is a democratic system?
- 2) What are the fundamental purposes of a democracy?
- 3) What tensions exist among values and principles of democracy?(e.g. liberty and equality, right to privacy and right to know)
- 4) What forces, events and actions have promoted movements towards democracy in the world?
- 5) What are the common problem in the development of democracy?
- 6) What are the advantages of democracy?
- 7) What are the disadvantages of democracy?
- 8) What are the appropriate relationships between the institutions of democratic government and military institutions?
- 9) What are the appropriate relationships between the institutions of democratic government and dissident groups?



The Citizen (adapted from the Center for Civic Education, 1994; Ochoa, 1995)

- 1) What is the role of a citizen in a democracy?
- 2) What is the importance of the citizen's relationship to the world?
- 3) What is the importance of the citizen's relationship to the political system? (e.g. patriotism, civic activism)
- 4) What is the importance of the citizen's relationship to Governmental Institutions? (e.g. participating, monitoring and influencing the use of governmental authority)
- 5) What is the importance of the citizen's relationship to other citizens? (e.g. Civility, tolerance, respect for rights, discussion and deliberation)
- 6) How can citizens take part in political life?
- 7) What civic dispositions of public and private character foster constitutional democracy?
- 8) Are there any civic dispositions or traits of public or private character that cannot be accommodated by constitutional democracy?
- 9) How can education promote the knowledgeable practice of democratic citizenship?

**APPENDIX F:
CONSENT FORM**

1) Name of participant: _____ I understand that I will not be identified by name in the reporting of this study _____ (initials of participant)

2) Statement of purpose:

The purpose of this study is to determine the how programs of study effect the democratic participation of students in terms of actions and attitudes inside and outside the classroom, during school age years and after graduation.

3) Expected results of study:

It is hoped that this study will identify educational programs that support and promote civic learning and participation in a democracy so that these programs can be expanded and populations can be encouraged and have the skills to become more active in there own governance.

4) Explanation of procedures and participant involvement: *(one or more of the following will be circled on the participants form depending on type of involvement)*

As a participant in this study you will

14390. be asked to answer some questions regarding your civic involvement in your classroom and your community in a simple interview questionnaire _____ (initials of participant)

14391. be observed in a classroom _____ (initials of participant)

14392. be asked to answer some questions regarding my attitudes and actions concerning civic involvement in your community in a focused interview

As the parent of a participant, who is under 18, your child will :

14402. be asked to answer some questions regarding his/her civic involvement in his/her classroom and community in a simple interview questionnaire _____ (initials of parent)

14403. be observed in a classroom _____ (initials of parent)

5) Expression of invitation to participate:

You have been asked to participate in this program because you are a member of _____ which has been chose for this study.
(name of school or community).

6) Statement of consent:

I have been informed of the nature of the research as outlined above and I voluntarily agree to be/to let my child _____ be a subject. I understand that I may withdraw myself/my child from the study at any time and I may ask any question before or during the study and that I may refuse to answer any question without penalty.

(Signature of participant)

(Signature of parent or guardian of participant)

(Signature of person obtaining consent)

(Date)

APPENDIX G
ACEPTACION DE PARTICIPACION

1) Nombre del participante: _____

Entiendo que no me van a identificar por mi nombre en el estudio de esta investigación _____ (iniciales del participante).

2) Proposito de la investigacion:

El proposito de este estudio, es determinar como los programas de estudio escolar afectan la participación democrática de los alumnos en cuanto sus acciones y actitudes dentro y fuera del colegio durante los años de estudio y despues de su graduación.

3) Resultados esperados de la investigacion

Se espera de esta investigación identificar programas de estudio que apoyen y promueven el aprendizaje de la convivencia y la participación democratica para que estos programas puedan ser expandidos y motivar a la gente que tengan las habilidades necesarias para ser más activas en su gobierno democratico.

4) Procedimiento y del participante: *(una or más de las actividades puede ser señalada según el tipo de participación)*

Como participante en esta investigacion estará:

14414. respondiendo preguntas acerca del compromiso civico dentro del salón de clase y comunidad a través de un cuestionario _____ (iniciales del participante)

14415. observado durante clase _____ (iniciales del participante)

14416. respondiendo preguntas respecto a sus actitudes and acciones de participaciones civicas en su comunidad a través de una entrevista

Como padre de un participante menor de 18 años su hijo estará:

14426. respondiendo preguntas acerca del compromiso civico en su colegio y comunidad a través de un cuestionario _____ (iniciales del padre o del madre)

14427. observado en su clase _____ (iniciales del padre o madre)

5) Invitación a participar

Usted a sido escogido por que ser un miembro de _____ que a sido seleccionado por esta investigación
(nombre de la escuela o la comunidad)

6) Declaración de participación:

He sido informado del tipo de investigación a realizar como lo indica en la parte superior y estoy dispuesta ser participante/ dejar que me hijo _____ sea participante. Entiendo que puedo retirarme/ mi hijo de esta investigación en cualquier momento, y puedo igualmente realizar preguntas antes y durante la investigación, y me puedo negar a contestar cualquier preguntas sin consecuencia alguna.

(Firma del participante)

(Firma del responsable del participante si tiene menos de 18 años)

(Firma de la persona consiguiendo el consentimiento)

(Fecha)

APPENDIX H:
ADMINISTRATIVE CONSENT FORM

The purpose of this study is to determine the how programs of study affect the democratic participation of students in terms of actions and attitudes inside and outside the classroom, during school age years and after graduation. It is expected that this study contribute knowledge about educational programs that support and promote civic learning and participation in a democracy so that these programs can be expanded and populations can be encouraged and have the skills to become more active in there own governance. The participants in your school will be providing information to this end. (Your school has been selected because you are currently involved in the application of the Escuela Nueva method of education) or (Your school has been selected for comparison with an Escuela Nueva school). The benefits of this study to you and your community will be a potential increase in the quality of schooling in your area and further knowledge about civic education in your area. During this interview, the participants may be asked about their political activities and attitudes inside the school and in their community. Your school will not be identified by name in this study.

You are free to refuse to participate or withdraw your consent at any time.

I, _____, consent to allow _____ to participate in the study.
(school)

(Signature of administrator)

(Date)

**APPENDIX I:
ETHICAL REVIEW FORMS**

Ethical Review: Statement of Intent
Ethical Review Protocol (4 pp.)
Ethical Certificate (1 p.)
Statement from Committee Members (3 pp.)

Ethical Reviews:

Statement of Intent for Student Theses and Projects

Title of this Project: Civic Education and Citizenship in Escuela Nueva Schools in Colombia

Student and Faculty Supervisor: Jennifer Pitt and Dr. J.P. Farrell

Department:

An Ethical review must be completed for each study which involves human subjects. Such a study involves the gathering of data through direct or indirect contact with people where the data can have an impact on their lives. Studies which do not involve the use of data collected from human subjects, or which involve the use of data collected from/on subjects where such data are in the public domain, do not require a full ethical review.

Please indicate by a checkmark below, the category into which the proposal fits. Students whose studies require an ethical review must complete an Ethical Review Protocol and complete the review with the help of their supervisor. Those students whose studies do not require full ethical review should complete and sign this form (along with their thesis supervisor), give it to the appropriate Department Chairperson for signature and then take or send it to the OISE/UT Graduate Studies Unit.

☐ This study does not involve data collection from/on human subjects.

(No Ethical Review required; Ethical Review Protocol not required)

☐ This study involves the analysis of data obtained from/on human subjects where such data are in the public domain (that is available from public archives and previously published materials).

(No Ethical Review required; Ethical Review Protocol not required)

☐ This study involves the analysis of data obtained from/on human subjects where such data are not in the public domain.

(Ethical Review required; Ethical Review Protocol must be completed)

☒ This study involves data collection from/on human subjects

(Ethical Review required; Ethical Review Protocol must be completed.)

Signature of Student

Signature of Faculty Supervisor

Signature of Department Chairperson to
indicate agreement if no Ethical Review
is required.



Ethical Review Protocol

To be completed by Principal Investigators for all studies which

- involve the use of human subjects, and/or
- involve the analysis of data collected from/on human subjects where such data are not in the public domain.

Title of Project/Thesis: Civic Learning and Participatory Democracy in Escuela Nueva Schools in Colombia

Student and Faculty Supervisor: Jennifer Pitt and Dr. J.P. Farrell

Department in which project/thesis will be housed: Curriculum Teaching and Learning, Comparative International and Development Education.

Objectives of Study: To identify and document how students in Escuela Nueva schools compare with students in regular rural schools in the understanding and demonstration of civic learning and citizenship inside and outside the classroom and after graduation from the program.

1. Data Collection

- (a) **What data are being collected?** (achievement scores, attitude scores, experimental test results, etc.)
The data being collected consist of political attitude scores and observations of democratic behaviour.
- (b) **How will the data be collected?** (Survey, questionnaire, structured interviews, observation, participant observation)
The data will be collected using questionnaires, semi-structured interviews and structured classroom observation. In addition, the investigators will keep a field diary in which they will record impressions from interviews and observation sessions.
- (c) **Procedures:** Please outline procedures to be followed in (a) and (b)
A different procedure will be used for each method of data collection. The investigators will conduct short interviews during which the participants will complete the questionnaires on classroom climate, political and democratic behaviour and political attitudes. An investigator will conduct structured observations of class activities using a chart outlining indicators of democratic behaviour and the investigator will keep notes in the field diary of the interactions producing these behaviours. The investigators will conduct semi-structured interviews using open questions and the investigator will keep notes on impressions from the interview in a field diary.
- (d) **Instruments:** Please list all questionnaires, tests, observation schedules, interview schedules etc. to be used. Attach copies where possible.
All questionnaires, semi-structured interviews and observation schedules can be found in Appendices B - F of this document.
- (e) **Indicate what information will be taken from existing records (e.g. school records, hospital records)**
The names of former graduates of the Escuela Nueva program and regular rural school programs.
- (f) **Curriculum Materials:** Where the study involves field testing of curriculum materials, please describe the materials (i.e. the substantive content) which are to be developed and tested.
None.

2. Subjects

- (b) **Describe the subject population and give the age/grade level and the affiliation as appropriate (e.g. school, university/college students, school board employees, hospital employees, members of the public). Indicate the number of subjects to be included in the study.**
Four subject populations will be tested in this study. These four groups consist of 90 school age children from Escuela Nueva schools, 90 school age children from regular rural school programs, 60 adult graduates of the Escuela Nueva program and 60 adult graduates of the regular rural school program. In total, 300 participants will be included in the study.

(b) **How will the subjects be selected for inclusion in the study?**

The subjects will be selected from sites which will consist of 3 communities in which Escuela Nueva schools exist and 3 geographically matched communities where Escuela Nueva schools do not exist. A sample will be taken from a the existing database as has been prepared over a five year period of evaluation by the Foundation Volvamos a la Gente. This sample consists of approximately 150 rural schools which have been evaluated for consistency with the Escuela Nueva methods. Since there is only one school per community, the communities where these schools exist will be identified and a sample of 3 communities for use in this study will be selected by lottery. All of children attending the schools in the chosen communities (approximately 30 in each community) will be interviewed and the graduates to be interviewed will be selected randomly from school records or found by word of mouth, depending on the availability of records.

3. **Data access and Interpretation**

(c) **Who will have access to the raw data?**

The principal investigators and anyone else who requests to see it to confirm results. However, the names of the participants and the names of the villages where the schools are located will not be available to anyone except the principle investigators.

(b) **How will confidentiality and /or anonymity of the raw data be maintained? (e.g. will names be deleted and replaced by codes known only to the investigators; will data be stored in locked files? Names will be deleted and replaced by codes and data will be stored in a secure area.**

(c) **What disposition will be made of the raw data at the end of the study? (e.g to be stored in data archives)**
Data will be stored in secure files.

(d) **What feedback will be given to subjects and/or to those individuals who provided informed or administrative consent?**
As stakeholders in the study, the participants and the communities will be informed of results via a community meeting and discussion on democracy in Colombia. The meeting will be open to everyone in the community, including those who did not participate in the study but may have an interest in the topic.

(e) **What steps will be taken to maintain anonymity of subjects and test sites in the written reports?**
Anonymity will be maintained by identifying the provinces where the schools are located but not the villages or the name of the participants.

(f) **What steps will be taken to alert participants to possible evaluative interpretation and to give them an opportunity to withdraw from the study? (By evaluative interpretation is meant, for example, the indirect evaluation of a teacher's professional performance or of a student's academic performance, as the result of participating in the study, where such evaluation is not an objective of the study).**
All data collected from the semi-structured interviews will be submitted to member checks. The participants be consulted so that they can refute any interpretation of their responses or withdraw from the study.

4. **Informed Consent***

(a) **Will informed consent be obtained from all participants?**

Yes ☒ No ☐

(b) **Will administrative consent be obtained?**

Yes ☒ No ☐

- (c) What steps will be taken to obtain individual informed consent and/or administrative consent?
The administration at each school in the study will be consulted and asked to sign a consent form.
- (d) Will the informed consent be written? Yes ☒ No ☐
If not, why not?
- (e) What information will be given to subjects and/or others who are providing informed consent?
Please attach a copy of each letter to be sent to potential participants. This letter should describe the study in lay terms, outline potential benefits/risks to participants, indicate that participants are free to withdraw at any time, outline what safeguards will be taken to maintain the confidentiality of the data and to protect participants from possible evaluation on the basis of the written report.

Administrative Consent

Administrative consent may be deemed sufficient:

where a) for studies which have as their intent and focus the acquisition of statistical information and the collection of data presents

- (i) no invasion of personal privacy;
- (ii) no potential social or emotional risk;

(b) for studies which have as their intent and focus the development and evaluation of curriculum materials, resources, guidelines, test items and program evaluation rather than the observation and evaluation of persons as individuals.

Signature of investigator (s)
or
Student and Faculty Supervisor

Date

